



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

buildings; partly because they were presumably initiated, if not executed, by Lord Baltimore himself.

J. H. POLLEN, S.J.,
Farm Street, London, England.

II

THE BENAVIDES MEMORIALS

The American historical world gave a hearty welcome to Mrs. Ayer's translation of the *Memorial of Fray Alonso de Benavides* (1630), not only because it is one of the scarcest of all *Americana*, but especially because this particular volume had gone through the skilled hands of Charles Fletcher Lummis and Frederick Webb Hodge. The elaborate notes by these two scholars are really a book in themselves and are rich in information and guidance for the student. The only regret was that the edition was private and limited to three hundred copies. Through the courtesy of Mr. Hodge, a copy was sent to the CATHOLIC HISTORICAL REVIEW, and a review of the volume appeared in the July, 1916, issue. Those interested in the subject for which the *Memorial* is an indispensable source: namely, the Church in the Southwest, will appreciate the value of a second *Memorial*, dated four years later (February 12, 1634), from the Propaganda Archives, which exists in photostatic copy among Dr. Guilday's *American Church History Manuscripts*, at the Catholic University, Washington, D. C. Along with the *Propaganda Memorial* are other collateral documents which treat of the same object. The relationship of the two *Memorials* is not exactly definable. Probably the *Propaganda Memorial* is a revision of the *Ayer Memorial*; but, if so, the former does not supersede the latter. It supplements in a certain measure the printed book by the addition of some valuable biographical and ethnological data. The printed *Memorial* remains an historical source of the first order, but scholars who wish to use it should know of the supplementary redaction. One of Dr. Guilday's students—the Rev. Virgil G. Michel, O.S.B.—is preparing the 1634 *Memorial* for publication. The following description will aid the reader to judge the comparative value of these manuscripts:

1. The *Ayer Memorial*.—This is a printed copy, very probably abridged and mutilated by the Spanish publisher or by someone else, of a Report on New Mexico, presented by Father Benavides, Guardian of the Franciscan missions there, to Philip IV of Spain, on the occasion of his visit to the mother country in 1630. It has not the systematic treatment of the later *Memorial*. It omits the names of the missionaries as a rule, and contains only incidental references to their work. It is more of a physical geography than a history, and was written to encourage the king to assist the missionaries to develop the country. It contains considerable information about the natural resources of the

land that is not found in the later work, but on the whole it is much briefer, less clear, and somewhat less valuable to the historian, since it not infrequently omits details that would vouch for the authenticity of its statements. There is sufficient evidence of this in the notes of the commentators to the present edition, passing adverse judgment on certain passages, the apparent weaknesses of which are cleared up in the *Propaganda Memorial*.

2. The **Propaganda Memorial** of February 12, 1634.—This was written at the request of Pope Urban VIII, and is in the hand-writing and bears the signature of Benavides himself. It was prepared for the information of the Holy Father concerning the missions, and with a view to obtaining extensive new privileges and the confirmation of old ones. It therefore lays stress on the extent and hardships of the work, and on the number of martyrs. Evidently, Benavides had the previous *Memorial* (the Ayer edition) before him when he wrote, although, strangely enough, he makes no reference to it, while he mentions his *Historia* twice. (One mention of this work was made in the first *Memorial*: there he said that with the help of God he was trying to write it at that time.) The *Propaganda Memorial* has, on the whole, a more interesting style than its prototype. It follows the history of the missions, and presents the physical features of the country as incidents to that work. It should have great historical value on account of its unimpeachable authenticity, its critical spirit, its wide scope of facts, and its freedom from the restrictions of a contemporary publisher. It pays a silent tribute to the scholarship of the learned annotators of the Ayer *Memorial*, by verifying many of their conclusions, although at times there is a wide divergence from their interpretation of the first text.

3. **Relazione delle conversione del Novo Messico** . . . April 11, 1917.—This is a summary, prepared by Benavides for the Propaganda, of his larger *Memorial* written for the Pope. It contains some details, however, that are not in the larger *Memorial*. It was poorly translated into Italian for Benavides, and signed by him. This suggests a Spanish counterpart that has not yet appeared, and points to the presence of Benavides in Rome at the time it was presented.

4. **Ristretto della Relazione** . . . dal Pre. Benavides.—This undated document seems to be a synopsis of the brief Italian *Relazione* (No. 3 above). It was made apparently as a summary introduction to the request for privileges made by Benavides. All the matter contained in the body of the *Ristretto* seems to be contained in the *Relazione*, with the exception of the last part, which is taken from the Spanish *Privilegios para las Indias*, appended to the *Ristretto* (noted below, No. 7).

5. **Ricordo Importante**.—This brief document, which is made a part of the *Ristretto*, deals with the English and Dutch colonies on the Atlantic coast and contains interesting and useful information; and, since no Spanish counterpart to it has been found, it suggests again the presence of Benavides in Rome, and his active attendance at the offices of the Propaganda during the presentation of his requests.

6. **Verificazione**.—This is a notarial appendix to the *Ristretto* for its authentication, and lists the testimonial letters presented by Benavides to the Propaganda.

7. **Privilegios para las Indias.**—This undated document, in Spanish and in the handwriting of Benavides, appears to be the complement of the *Relazione* (No. 3), and again suggests a lost counterpart to the latter. It requests the confirmation of previous privileges and the erection of the bishopric of Santa Fe. It suggests the date for the *Ristretto*, for it requests action before the end of June, when Benavides will sail for the Indies, and since the document which it supplements was presented on April 11, the *Ristretto* must have been made shortly afterwards.

8, 9, 10. These three documents, though still undiscovered, should be listed for the purpose of comparison. The first of these is the important *Historia* noted above (No. 2); the other two are the respective Spanish originals of the *Relazione* and the *Ricordo Importante*.

The order of the documents in the Propaganda Archives is as follows: (1) The *Ristretto*, with its appendices, the *Ricordo Importante* and the *Verificazione*; (2) the *Privilegios para las Indias*; (3) the *Relazione*; (4) the *Memorial* of February 12, 1634. The chronological order of the whole series should be: (1) the *Ayer Memorial*; (2) the *Historia*; (3) the *Propaganda Memorial*; (4) the Spanish original of the *Relazione*; (5) the Spanish original of the *Ricordo Importante*; (6) the *Privilegios para las Indias*; (7) the *Relazione*; (8) the *Ristretto*; (9) the *Ricordo Importante*; (10) the *Verificazione*.

JOHN F. O'HARA, C.S.C.,
Washington, D. C.